

Heuristic Evaluation of [keynotes]

For a more in-depth overview of A9, please refer to the [A9 assignment spec](#).

1. Problem/Prototype Description

Keynotes is an application intended to restructure and personalize the feedback process for musicians, providing a reliable platform where users can easily connect with one another to obtain one-on-one and crowdsourced feedback.

2. Violations Found

Task 1: Upload a New Track

1. H10: Help & Documentation / Severity: 2
 - Task: Upload a new track
 - Description: Upload images button doesn't relate to how the track is displayed for feedback.
 - Rationale: Unclear what the utility of uploading images is. Affects user understanding but doesn't break core functionality.
 - Fix: Clearly explain the purpose of uploading images and how it contributes to user feedback. Align the feature with the track display for better context.
2. H11: Accessible Design / Severity: 2 / Found by B
 - Task: Upload a new track
 - Description: Small text for the name of the track, compared to larger text for other inputs.
 - Rationale: Aesthetic choices are difficult for visually impaired - small text. Aesthetic and accessibility issue, but doesn't break core functionality.
 - Fix: Optimize text size for better visibility, especially for the visually impaired.
3. H11: Accessible Design / Severity: 3
 - Task: Upload a new track
 - Description: While artist can upload lyrics, the reviewer cannot access the lyrics to review
 - Rationale: If artists can upload lyrics but reviewers cannot access them, it limits the reviewer's ability to provide comprehensive feedback.
 - Fix: Allow reviewers to access and view the uploaded lyrics along with the track.
 - Fix: Introduce a reporting option to address privacy and safety concerns.
4. H7: Flexibility & Efficiency of Use / Severity: 2
 - Task: Upload a new track
 - Description: Advanced options button is larger than the post track button
 - Rationale: Buttons compete with each other in hierarchy. Users may accidentally press "Advanced options" when they mean to press "Post track", slowing them down. Affects the visual hierarchy but doesn't break core functionality.
 - Fix: Adjust the size and placement of buttons to ensure a clear visual hierarchy. Make the "Post track" button more prominent.

5. H7: Flexibility & Efficiency of Use / Severity: 3
 - Task: Upload a new track
 - Description: On the “Advanced options” screen, the “Upload Images” and “Edit Preferences for Track” buttons are larger than the save button.
 - Rationale: Might slow users down or make it unclear where they go to save because of multiple calls to actions. May confuse users about where to save, impacting usability.
 - Fix: Reorganize the layout for a more intuitive flow. Ensure the "Save" button is appropriately sized and positioned for user convenience.
6. H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design / Severity: 2
 - Task: Upload a new track
 - Description: The text area is small on the screen and relies on text input.
 - Rationale: Users might upload a file of their lyrics or want to type out longer lyrics. Also slows users down. Affects user understanding but doesn't break core functionality.
 - Fix: Provide an option to expand the text area for users with longer lyrics. Consider allowing file uploads for lyrics.
7. H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design / Severity: 1
 - Task: Upload a new track
 - Description: Anywhere in the world the checkbox is a rectangle rather than a square.
 - Rationale: Checkbox doesn't necessarily look like a textbox, which could confuse users on how they can use it. Slowing them down.
 - Fix: Make the checkbox look more like a checkbox, and consider using standard checkbox symbols for clarity.
8. H6: Recognition not Recall / Severity: 3
 - Task: Upload a new track
 - Description: Unclear what elements are required to post a track, and what are optional.
 - Rationale: Users may feel like they have to fill out all the information in advanced options to proceed. Lack of clarity may hinder users from successfully posting a track.
 - Fix: Clearly indicate required and optional fields. Use visual cues such as asterisks (*) for required elements. Provide tooltips or help icons for additional guidance.
9. H6: Recognition not Recall / Severity: 2
 - Task: Upload a new track
 - Description: Add questions for musicians giving you feedback is vague.
 - Rationale: Users may not know what questions they want to be asked or are not sure what would be most helpful. Affects user understanding but doesn't break core functionality.
 - Fix: Offer predefined questions or prompts to guide users. Include examples or suggestions for effective feedback
10. H5: Error Prevention / Severity: 2
 - Task: Upload a new track
 - Description: Can't edit how much of the track you want to upload
 - Rationale: Users have to edit what they upload and make sure it's what they want to upload before opening the app. While it may slow users down, it doesn't break the main functionality.
 - Fix: Implement an editing feature allowing users to select specific portions of the track for upload.
11. H4: Consistency & Standards / Severity: 1

- Task: Upload a new track
 - Description: Double space in the text of “advanced options”
 - Rationale: Minor inconsistency across text.
 - Fix: Remove unnecessary spaces to maintain consistency in the text layout.
12. H3: User Control & Freedom / Severity: 3
- Task: Upload a new track
 - Description: Edit preferences for track are in advanced options, but you can't see the track while you edit.
 - Rationale: Requires users to remember the track that they uploaded, slowing them down as they have to navigate back and forth. Slows users down and affects usability.
 - Fix: Implement a split-screen or pop-up preview to allow users to see the track while editing preferences.
13. H1: Visibility of System Status / Severity: 3
- Task: Upload a new track
 - Description: Track “uploads” automatically (hard coded to replace with an image).
 - Rationale: May be confused by the status of the upload. This affects the core functionality of the app and could cause confusion for users during the upload process.
 - Fix: Need feedback to the user that it has uploaded while it's in progress to show, like a real-time progress indicator during the upload process
14. H1: Visibility of System Status / Severity: 3
- Task: Upload a new track
 - Description: Can't play audio / video after updating it
 - Rationale: Users need to remember what they uploaded. Affects the ability to preview uploaded content, impacting user experience significantly.
 - Fix: Allow users to preview their uploaded content immediately after updating. Provide playback controls for audio and video.
15. H1: Visibility of System Status / Severity: 3
- Description: There is no notification for whether the uploading process has completed or if the file is ready for upload.
- Rationale: Users should be notified throughout the upload process and may be confused on whether they are ready to post track.
 - Fix: Create a progress upload bar for a visual representation of upload status.
16. H1: Visibility of System Status / Severity: 1
- Description: The main upload screen does not display whether the advanced options button has been interacted with and progress has been saved.
- Rationale: Users may not know if they have already edited advanced options and if their changes have been saved since there is no indication on the main upload page.
 - Fix: Add visual notification that changes have been made to the advanced options section on the main upload page.
17. H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design / Severity: 2 / Found by C
- Description: There is a dotted outline for the space in which you upload tracks and add lyrics or questions for musicians in the advanced options section when uploading a track.
- Rationale: Users may be confused with which parts of the upload process are optional to fill in. Although it can be assumed that uploading a track is required, the design may make it confusing to see whether the advanced options are required as well.
 - Fix: Create a different outline between optional and required information sections or add

some notifying message.

18. H9: Help Users with Errors / Severity: 2

Description: Users cannot edit or delete a track once it has been posted.

- Rationale: Users may be frustrated by the lack of clarity on the permanence of posting a track and the inability to manage it once it has been posted.

Fix: Add a “manage tracks” option to select or edit tracks. Additionally, add a “confirm upload” button to ensure the user can double check their submission before posting.

19. H4: Consistency & Standards / Severity 1 / Found By: D

- Page: Upload Page
- Description: If you click “Advanced options” the “Cancel” button turns into a “Back” button.
- Rationale: “Cancel” and “Back” appear to serve the same purpose in this context, but different wording is used.
- Fix: Use either “Cancel” or “Back” for all screens in the upload flow.

20. H4: Consistency & Standards / Severity 1 / Found By: D

- Page: Upload Page
- Description: For some buttons, the second word uses all lowercase. E.g. “Delete upload” and “Advanced options.”
- Rationale: This looks inconsistent with the “Post Track” button, which capitalizes the first letter in the second word.
- Fix: Ensure that all buttons capitalize the first letter of each word.

21. H5: Error Prevention / Severity 2 / Found By: D

- Page: Upload Page
- Description: After pressing the “Delete upload” button, there is no way to confirm that I actually want to do this.
- Rationale: Before deleting assets, you should confirm with the user that this is what they want to do.
- Fix: Add confirmation UI that allows the user to confirm that they meant to delete their upload.

Task 2: View feedback on a track

1. H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design / Severity: 2

- Task: View feedback on your track
- Description: Spacing between report user and feedback from Jerry is really close
- Rationale: The close spacing between the "report user" and "feedback from Jerry" creates visual clutter and may lead to user confusion.
- Fix: Increase the spacing between the "report user" and "feedback from Jerry".

2. H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design / Severity: 1

- Task: View feedback on your track
- Description: Text boxes for answers to your questions are small
- Rationale: Small text boxes for answers make it challenging to read and provide long-form feedback.
- Fix: Enlarge the text boxes for answers to questions.

3. H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design / Severity: 2

- Task: View feedback on your track
- Description: Audio message from Jerry is the largest CTA

- Rationale: The larger size of the CTA for the audio message from Jerry may draw excessive attention.
 - Fix: Adjust the size of the CTA for the audio message to be consistent with other CTAs.
4. H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design / Severity: 1
 - Task: View feedback on your track
 - Description: Messaging Jerry appears on top of the picture of Jerry
 - Rationale: Placing the messaging over Jerry's picture conflicts with the image and creates confusion about which button to press on the profile.
 - Fix: Reconsider the placement of messaging on Jerry's picture to avoid conflicts.
 5. H6: Recognition not Recall / Severity: 3
 - Task: View feedback on your track
 - Description: General feedback is a lot to read, with inconsistent sizes of text boxes
 - Rationale: Inconsistent text box sizes and a large amount of information requested from the user for general feedback can be overwhelming.
 - Fix: Streamline the feedback process, possibly by breaking down the information into smaller sections.
 6. H5: Error Prevention / Severity: 3
 - Task: View feedback on your track
 - Description: Not sure why the report user is a prominent option - colored in a primary color while the audio message is colored in a lighter color
 - Rationale: The prominence of the "report user" option in a primary color, compared to the audio message option in a lighter color, creates a confusing hierarchy.
 - Fix: Adjust the visual hierarchy to appropriately emphasize the audio message option.
 7. H4: Consistency & Standards / Severity: 1
 - Task: View feedback on your track
 - Description: General feedback text size is different than the text size for answers to your questions
 - Rationale: Inconsistent text sizes between general feedback and answers to questions can create a disjointed visual experience.
 - Fix: Maintain a consistent text size across general feedback and answers.
 8. H4: Consistency & Standards / Severity: 1
 - Task: View feedback on your track
 - Description: Back button and view profile button are different text size
 - Rationale: Different text sizes for the back button and view profile button are inconsistent and can lead to user confusion.
 - Rationale: Standardize the text sizes of buttons such as the back button and view profile button.
 9. H4: Consistency & Standards / Severity: 1
 - Task: View feedback on your track
 - Description: Back button and view profile button are different text size
 - Rationale: Different text sizes for the back button and view profile button are inconsistent and can lead to user confusion.
 - Fix: Standardize the text sizes of buttons such as the back button and view profile button.
 10. H4: Consistency & Standards / Severity: 1
 - Task: View feedback on your track

- Description: Jerry's profile picture icon doesn't match their profile picture on their page
 - Rationale: Inconsistency between Jerry's profile picture icon and their actual profile picture may lead to user confusion.
 - Fix: Ensure consistency between Jerry's profile picture icon and their actual profile picture to avoid user confusion.
11. H4: Consistency & Standards / Severity: 1
- Task: View feedback on your track
 - Description: All buttons are the same size and styles.
 - Rationale: All buttons having the same size can create ambiguity regarding their importance or function.
 - Fix: Differentiate button sizes based on their significance or action to guide users and provide visual cues.
12. H4: Consistency & Standards / Severity: 2
- Task: View feedback on your track
 - Description: Name of musician not left aligned with the other elements
 - Rationale: The misalignment of the musician's name with other elements and lack of guiding white space can disrupt the visual flow.
 - Fix: Ensure proper alignment of the musician's name with other interface elements.
13. H3: User Control & Freedom / Severity: 3
- Task: View feedback on your track
 - Description: Can't play audio message from Jerry
 - Rationale: Requiring users to go into a separate screen to listen to an audio message from Jerry can disrupt the user experience.
 - Fix: Implement an inline audio player within the main interface.
14. H1: Visibility of System Status / Severity: 3
- Task: View feedback on your track
 - Description: From the feedback screen, unclear who Jerry is unless I view their profile
 - Rationale: Lack of clarity about Jerry's identity without viewing their profile can cause confusion.
 - Fix: Provide essential information about Jerry on the feedback screen without requiring users to take additional actions.
15. H1: Visibility of System Status / Severity: 3
- Description: After clicking on view feedback for a track, the notification at the top of the screen that says "received feedback from 12 musicians" does not indicate whether the feedback is new or if it's just a list of feedback.
 - Rationale: Users may be confused by whether that line determines that they have received new feedback in their inbox, represents the total number of feedback, or unread feedback, potentially making feedback selection harder.
Fix: Clarify the notification text by using words that highlight whether the feedback is new, unread, or is the total number of feedback.
16. H7: Flexibility & Efficiency of Use / Severity: 3
- Description: All feedback is titled as "View feedback" and users cannot see all feedback responses unless they click through each individual feedback page separately.
- Rationale: If users want to view a specific piece of feedback again, they are unable to quickly scroll through and find it. Additionally, each piece of feedback is just labeled as "View feedback" which may be frustrating to click through to find a particular one.

Fix: Integrate sections of each user's feedback into the main feedback page or allow for a scrollable option to easily scroll through snippets of all feedback at once, with an additional "View all" option per user to read the full feedback. Or, add a "next" button at the top of each individual feedback screen to directly access the next one.

17. H7: Flexibility & Efficiency of Use / Severity: 3

Description: Users cannot organize feedback when searching for specific answers to questions.

- Rationale: It is inefficient for a user that is working to fix a particular problem in their music when they are unable to search through a categorized list of feedback to find answers to their questions.

Fix: Add a notification section to view new notifications of feedback. Categorize feedback and let users see if their question has been answered.

18. H7: Flexibility & Efficiency of Use / Severity: 3

Description: No option for users to delete or archive feedback that has already been viewed.

- Rationale: Once users start receiving more feedback, there may be potential overflow and disarray as large inboxes are hard to organize, leading to some frustration.

Fix: Add an archive and manage feedback option to organize and store feedback entries.

19. H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design / Severity: 2

Description: The "Report User" button is of the same design, size, and relative location as the "View Profile" on the top right of the screen.

- Rationale: Users may confuse the two options with one another, and the "Report User" button looks like a primary button although it should only be used in unique cases.

Fix: Minimize the "Report User" button and change the design to make it less prominent.

20. H10: Help & Documentation / Severity: 2

Description: There is no help or documentation for understanding or navigating an individual feedback page.

- Rationale: Features like receiving audio messages are hard to understand for a new user without proper documentation or further explanations.

Fix: Add an exclamation icon for any function that may need further explanation.

21. H11: Accessible Design / Severity: 2

Description: No text-based alternative, closed captioning, or visual aid provided in place of the "Audio message" feature, which wouldn't be used just for recording a message but also for musical corrections and examples.

- Rationale: Inclusivity is important to ensure that all users can access and benefit from the same features.

Fix: For users that are hard of hearing, provide a visual aid or another appropriate alternative.

22. H7: Flexibility & Efficiency of Use / Severity 3 / Found By: D

- Page: Profile Page

- Description: As a user of this app, the most important thing to me is the feedback on my tracks. It looks like the only way to view this info is from my own profile page, which shows me information about myself before it shows me my tracks.

- Rationale: I rarely need to look at my own profile information, but I will frequently need to look at the feedback on my tracks.

- Fix: Perhaps add some sort of "Tracks" page that is distinct from the profile page. This page should be accessible from the navigation bar.

23. H4: Consistency & Standards / Severity 1 / Found By: D
 - Page: Feedback from User Page
 - Description: The boxes with the dotted lines make me feel like these are input boxes (which is the case on the upload page).
 - Rationale: Using the same box UI for inputs and outputs may be confusing to users.
 - Fix: Remove the boxes from the feedback and emphasize feedback another way (perhaps with font size or color).
24. H7: Flexibility & Efficiency of Use / Severity 1 / Found By: D
 - Page: Feedback from User Page
 - Description: The audio message is too far down the page.
 - Rationale: If someone has left me an audio message, I probably want to listen to this first before reading the written feedback.
 - Fix: Move audio message to the top of the page.
25. H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design / Severity 1 / Found By: D
 - Page: Feedback from User Page
 - Description: Explicit “View Profile” button is unnecessary.
 - Rationale: Most users expect that clicking a user’s photo or name will take them to the user’s profile.
 - Fix: Remove the “View Profile” button and update the user’s profile photo (and optionally their name) to be a link to the user’s profile.

Task 3: Find a new musician and give feedback

1. H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design / Severity: 3
 - Task: Find a new musician on the app and give them feedback
 - Description: View profile and add buttons are really small
 - Rationale: Hard for users to tap.
 - Fix: Enlarge the view profile and add buttons for better touch accessibility.
2. H7: Flexibility & Efficiency of Use / Severity: 1
 - Task: Find a new musician on the app and give them feedback
 - Description: Many profiles to focus on at once from multiple
 - Rationale: Having many profiles on the screen can be overwhelming and distracting.
 - Fix: Implement sorting or filtering options to allow users to customize their view, making it easier to focus on specific profiles.
3. H4: Consistency & Standards / Severity: 3
 - Task: Find a new musician on the app and give them feedback
 - Description: Give verbal feedback has multiple buttons (chat, microphone, request meeting)
 - Rationale: The presence of multiple buttons (chat, microphone, request meeting) for verbal feedback can create confusion about their respective functions.
 - Fix: Streamline verbal feedback options into a single, clearly labeled button or menu, or a multi-step flow.
4. H4: Consistency & Standards / Severity: 3
 - Task: Find a new musician on the app and give them feedback
 - Description: Buttons on the top (back, view profile, add friend) all have the same size and hierarchy with different text sizes

- Rationale: Back button is equally emphasized as the view profile and add friend buttons. Uniform button sizes and hierarchy for top buttons, especially when dealing with different actions like going back, viewing a profile, and adding a friend, can create confusion.
 - Fix: Differentiate button sizes and hierarchy based on their importance and function.
5. H1: Visibility of System Status / Severity: 2
- Task: Find a new musician on the app and give them feedback
 - Description: Give feedback button appears above waveform
 - Rationale: Placing the feedback button above the waveform can create confusion about the interaction hierarchy.
 - Fix: Move the feedback button below the waveform to create a logical sequence; users should listen to the track before providing feedback.
6. H1: Visibility of System Status / Severity: 2
- Task: Find a new musician on the app and give them feedback
 - Description: No way to reference the track that is listened to for feedback other than hitting back
 - Rationale: Without a direct way to reference the track being listened to, users may find it challenging to provide specific feedback.
 - Fix: Include a reference option or playback button that allows users to revisit the track while providing feedback.
7. H3: User control and Freedom / Severity: 2
- Description: There is no option to save draft for feedback and edit later.
- Rationale: In case the user needs to click out of the “Give Feedback” page to listen to the track again or accidentally clicks out of the page, they risk losing progress on the feedback.
- Fix: Add a save draft button.
8. H3: User control and Freedom / Severity: 2 / Found by: B
- Description: The user cannot access the “Give Feedback” form again after clicking “View Profile” on the top right corner.
- Rationale: There lacks a “Back” button when viewing profile, although this may just be a Figma error. However, it adds to the need for more permanence in the feedback form, such as a draft option or reviewing before submitting or exiting the feedback page.
- Fix: Add a “Back” button when viewing profile from the feedback page.
9. H3: User control and Freedom / Severity: 3 / Found by: B
- Description: When clicking on “Post Feedback”, the user is automatically taken back to the profile screen of who they gave feedback to.
- Rationale: The navigation may not be intuitive to a user who is scrolling through the explore page to listen to multiple tracks in a row. There was also no expectation by the user to be brought to the profile of the person they are giving feedback to.
- Fix: Add a “back” button to take the user back to the explore page.
10. H6: Recognition not Recall / Severity: 3 / Found by: B
- Description: Users do not have access to the track they are commenting on once they click on give feedback.
- Rationale: Users have to actively recall the track or go back to the “Explore” page to relisten, which can be frustrating when giving feedback.
- Fix: Provide the track at the top of the “give feedback” page to make the feedback

giving process more efficient.

11. H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design / Severity: 3

Description: The navigation bar with “Profile, Explore, Friends, Upload” is still visible on the give feedback screen despite it not being used for that task.

- Rationale: The give feedback screen is cluttered because of the navigation bar, making it overwhelming for the user when they are attempting their task of giving feedback.

Fix: Remove the navigation bar on the give feedback screen.

12. H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design / Severity: 3

Description: Viewing another user’s profile shows a “Message” and “Add Friend” button in the place of the “Preferences” and “Edit profile” button in the user’s personal profile page.

- Rationale: The user may be confused by the similar buttons, which are in the same location and have the same design, when going between their page and another users’

Fix: Differentiate the buttons by changing the “Add Friend” and “Message” icon to something more intuitive, such as a chat icon or an icon of a silhouette and a plus sign.

13. H9: Help Users with Errors / Severity: 2 / Found by: B

Description: When clicking on “Post Feedback”, there is no notification indicating that feedback has been submitted or processed by the system.

- Rationale: The user may be unsure whether or not their feedback has been submitted, which may lead to frustration or uncertainty over their actions.

Fix: Add a notification for when feedback has been successfully submitted.

14. H1 Visibility of System Status / Severity: 3

- Task: Find a new musician and give feedback

- Description: Can’t tell which tab I am on in the navigation panel.

- Rationale: Users may get confused as to where they are in the app.

- Fix: Update UI to switch tab color based on where you are

15. H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design / Severity: 1

- Task: Find a new musician on the app and give them feedback

- Description: Text area to give feedback is small for the violin and lyrics

- Rationale: A small text area limits the amount of feedback users can provide for specific elements like the violin and lyrics.

- Fix: Enlarge the text area for specific feedback elements for more detailed responses.

16. H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design / Severity: 2

- Task: Find a new musician on the app and give them feedback

- Description: Name of musician is really small compared to the give feedback button

- Rationale: The small size of the musician's name compared to the feedback button can affect the perceived importance of information.

- Fix: Increase the size of the musician's name to match the importance of other elements on the page.

17. H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design / Severity: 2

- Task: Find a new musician on the app and give them feedback

- Description: Audio waveform play button is small.

- Rationale: A small and difficult-to-tap play button affects usability.

- Fix: Enlarge the button enhances touch accessibility and ensures a smoother interaction.

18. H11: Accessible Design / Severity: 2

- Task: Find a new musician on the app and give them feedback

- Description: Only image and name being used to describe Jessica’s profile

- Rationale: This issue limits accessibility for visually impaired users, as they cannot discern the instrument Jessica plays without listening to the track.
 - Fix: Add an accessibility feature that provides additional descriptive information about the musician's instrument or style on the profile page.
19. H12: Value Alignment & Inclusion / Severity: 3 / Found by B
- Task: Find a new musician on the app and give them feedback
 - Description: No option to report the user, while reporting option is given in other places
 - Rationale: The absence of an option to report the user is a privacy and safety concern. Including a reporting option ensures a mechanism for addressing inappropriate content or behavior.
20. H3: User Control & Freedom / Severity: 3
- Task: Find a new musician on the app and give them feedback
 - Description: Audio waveform doesn't let me adjust controls of how much I want to listen to or replay
 - Rationale: Lack of controls for adjusting the audio playback may frustrate users who want to fine-tune their listening experience.
 - Fix: Introduce audio control options such as volume, playback speed, and a seek bar to give users more control over their listening experience.
21. H6: Recognition not Recall / Severity 3 / Found By: D
- Page: Explore Page
 - Description: I am unclear on what content is being shown to be on this page. My initial assumption was that it was showing me potential friends that I can add. But the more time I spend on it, I feel like it's actually showing me specific tracks that I can give feedback on (?)
 - Rationale: The explore page appears to be a core page in your app, so when your user navigates to this page, it should be very clear what content they are looking at.
 - Fix: If this page is in fact meant to show the user tracks, I would update the top of each track card to include the name of the track. E.g. "Springtime Symphony by Jessica H." or "Track 1 by Jessica H."
22. H6: Recognition not Recall / Severity 1 / Found By: D
- Page: Explore Page
 - Description: I'm not 100% sure what will happen when I click the play button.
 - Rationale: The only way that I'll know what that button does is if I click it for a user and then remember what the button is for.
 - Fix: Instead of just using a play icon, have some sort of minimal label that lets a user know what happens if they press play in this context.
23. H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design / Severity 1 / Found By: D
- Page: Explore Page
 - Description: Explicit "View Profile" button is unnecessary.
 - Rationale: Most users expect that clicking a user's photo or name will take them to the user's profile.
 - Fix: Remove the "View Profile" button and update the user's name to be a link to the user's profile.
24. H7: Flexibility & Efficiency of Use / Severity 3 / Found By: D
- Page: Give Feedback Page

- Description: There's no way to easily replay the track that I'm giving feedback on as I'm entering in the feedback. I either have to go back to the explore page to play it again or just remember what my feedback was.
 - Rationale: If I'm trying to give critical feedback on a piece, I may want to play parts of it multiple times.
 - Fix: Add some UI at the top of this page that allows the user to replay the track they're giving feedback on.
25. H7: Flexibility & Efficiency of Use / Severity 2 / Found By: D
- Page: Give Feedback Page
 - Description: There's no way to easily see critical information about the user who wrote the track as I'm giving feedback on the track. If I want to see info about the user, I have to navigate to their profile.
 - Rationale: Some information about the user (such as their experience level) will heavily impact what feedback is given. Ideally, this info would be easily accessible from the feedback page without having to view the user's full profile.
 - Fix: Add critical user information (such as their experience level and possibly their principal instrument) to the top of the feedback page, with the option of viewing the user's full profile if desired.
26. H6: Recognition not Recall / Severity 1 / Found By: D
- Page: Give Feedback Page
 - Description: In the "Give Verbal Feedback" section, it's unclear to me what the icon on the far right does (the icon with the ellipses).
 - Rationale: It should be clear what each icon does without having to click it.
 - Fix: Update this icon to be something more clear or make it a button that is clearly labeled.
27. H1: Visibility of System Status / Severity 2 / Found By: D
- Page: Give Feedback Page
 - Description: After clicking "Post Feedback" I'm not told if my post was successful or not.
 - Rationale: I want to know that my feedback post actually went through without errors.
 - Fix: Add success UI to let the user know that their feedback post was successful.

Task 4: Change your preferences for which musicians can give you feedback

1. H6: Recognition not Recall / Severity: 2 / Found by A
 - Task: Change your preferences for which musicians can give you feedback
 - Description: Edit preferences' form is unclear what searching for instruments will do.
 - Rationale: Users may not know what they need to do in this input and what instruments they should add.
 - Fix: Include descriptive labels and tooltips to clarify the purpose of the instrument search. Provide examples or suggestions for users.
2. H2: Match b/w System & World / Severity: 2
 - Task: Change your preferences for which musicians can give you feedback
 - Description: Years of experience slider doesn't necessarily map to the real world.
 - Rationale: Someone may have many years of experience but be an amateur, while others may have a few years but be a pro.

- Fix: Provide additional context or tooltips about the expectations for years of experience.
- 3. H4: Consistency & Standards / Severity: 3
 - Description: The term “Preferences” has been used on both the individual personal profile and when uploading a track, with little differentiation between the two.
 - Rationale: “Preferences” isn’t intuitive when used for both of these cases since it can be interpreted as preferences for the explore page or preferences for the feedback the user wants to receive on their track. The user may also think that both buttons lead to the same page, causing potential confusion.
Fix: Reword the preferences buttons to make them more intuitive for the user or change the design to indicate different functionalities. If the functionalities are the same, indicate so.
- 4. H5: Error Prevention / Severity: 2
 - Description: There is no confirm submission notification or summary of changes when saving preferences.
 - Rationale: The user may make accidental changes that can cause confusion or unintended results.
Fix: Add a summary of changes or confirm submission button before a user can submit.
- 5. H7: Flexibility & Efficiency of Use / Severity: 2 / Also found by C
 - Description: The only input method for both “Years of experience” and “Geographic Proximity” within the preferences page is with the sliders, and there is no alternative method for information input like typing a number in.
 - Rationale: There is no flexibility for users that want a more specific or broad distance outside of the range of the sliders. Once the slider reaches a certain number, it stops, making it seem like the user has less options.
Fix: Add an input section that allows the user to type in a number, in addition to the sliders.
- 6. H12: Value Alignment & Inclusion / Severity: 2 / found by C
 - Description: When exploring musicians and identifying preferences, there is no option for choosing a genre or users of specific backgrounds.
 - Rationale: When a user specifies preferences, to avoid bias in feedback and to foster inclusivity, the user should have an option to filter for music they like.
Fix: Add a section for genres in the “Explore” page and add a profile label.
- 7. H4 Consistency and standards / Severity: 3
 - Task: Change your preferences for which musicians can give you feedback
 - Description: “Preferences” and “Edit profile” sound similar and it may be hard to tell at first glance which does what
 - Rationale: Users may not know which one to press to find settings
 - Fix: Adjust wording for preferences
- 8. H12: Value Alignment & Inclusion / Severity 3 / Found By: D
 - Page: Feedback Preferences Page
 - Description: It appears that there isn’t an option to only allow people who you are friends with to give you feedback.
 - i. If it is your intention that only friends can give each other feedback, then I’m not 100% sure what this page is for.

- ii. If it is your intention that anyone who meets the criteria in your preferences can give you feedback (regardless of whether or not they are a friend), then this is where I see a potential value alignment issue (see rationale below).
 - Rationale: Some users may be too sensitive to open themselves up to getting feedback by people who they have not explicitly added as a friend.
 - Fix: Allow users to select that they only want to receive feedback from friends.
- 9. H6: Recognition not Recall / Severity 1 / Found By: D
 - Page: Profile Page
 - Description: It's not clear to me what happens when I click "Preferences," as this could mean a lot of things in the context of a mobile app.
 - Rationale: It should be clear what page this button will take you to.
 - Fix: Update the button label to something like "Feedback Preferences."
- 10. H6: Recognition not Recall / Severity 2 / Found By: D
 - Page: Feedback Preferences Page
 - Description: The "Years of Experience" slider needs more clarification.
 - Rationale: It seems like this slider is meant to indicate the minimum years of experience that the user must have in order to give you feedback, but that's not crystal clear.
 - Fix: Ideally this section would let you choose experience levels that you will accept feedback from as opposed to the number of years of experience that the user has. I assume that your users care more about the person's level than they do about the exact number of years they've been playing for.
- 11. H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design / Severity 1 / Found By: D
 - Page: Feedback Preferences Page
 - Description: The "Anywhere in the world" option should be above the proximity slider.
 - Rationale: Clicking the "Anywhere in the world" option makes the proximity slider irrelevant, so that option should ideally be above the proximity slider.
 - Fix: Move the "Anywhere in the world" option above the proximity slider. If this option is selected, disable the proximity slider altogether.
- 12. H1: Visibility of System Status / Severity 2 / Found By: D
 - Page: Feedback Preferences Page
 - Description: After clicking "Save" I'm not told if my preferences were successfully saved.
 - Rationale: I want to know that my preferences were saved without errors.
 - Fix: Add success UI to let the user know that their preferences were saved.

All tasks / Extra Violations

- 1. H4: Consistency & Standards / Severity: 3
 - Description: On the profiles of the users in the "Explore" page, there is an option to view profile next to their name. However, in the "Friends" page, that option is gone and you are unable to click on view profile unless you click on "Give feedback" for the friend.
 - Rationale: This may have just been a Figma or design error as there was an "Add Friend" option once you click on "Give feedback" for your friend, but it can be confusing due to the inconsistency with profiles.

- Fix: Make profiles consistent and easy access to viewing full profiles of your friends.
2. H4: Consistency & Standards / Severity: 2
 - Description: On the “Feedback” page, there is a visual tag of giving verbal feedback as optional. Yet when uploading a track and editing advanced options, there is no optional tag.
 - Rationale: Since advanced options are a separate button outside of the upload page, it seems reasonable to think of the contents to be optional. Yet with no tag saying it is while there being a tag on other pages, there is a lack of consistency and possible confusion for the user.
 - Fix: Clearly indicate which options are optional.
 3. H4 Consistency and standards / Severity: 2
 - Task: All tasks
 - Description: On some tabs, it says “back” and on others it says “cancel”
 - Rationale: Inconsistent wording for same task
 - Fix: Make wording consistent
 4. H3 User control and freedom
 - Severity: 4
 - Description: When on friend’s page and giving feedback, there is no back button.
 - Rationale: Users may click “give feedback” on accident and not have a way back
 - Fix: Add back button
 5. H6 Recognition rather than recall / Severity: 2
 - Description: When on “explore” and “friends” tab, the feed looks identical but no indication of which tab you’re on
 - Rationale: Users may get confused as to which feed they’re on
 - Fix: Add a header
 6. H8 Aesthetic and minimalist design / Severity: 1
 - Description: There is a shadow on the bottom but not the top
 - Rationale: If supposed to look like “floating tiles” maybe more of a distinct shadow or something like outline on the top could help separate posts from the background
 - Fix: Add outline or shadows
 7. H11 Accessible Design / Severity: 1
 - Description: On tabs for making post or giving feedback, words could be slightly larger font
 - Rationale: Some people with bad vision may have trouble reading text if too small
 - Fix: Adjust font size
 8. H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design / Severity 1 / Found By: D
 - Page: Profile Page
 - Description: The word “YOU” is prominently featured in bold letters.
 - Rationale: If the user is on their own profile page, they know that the information on that page is about them.
 - Fix: Remove “YOU”

3. Summary of Violations

Refer to  Keynote for data analysis.

Category	# Viol. (sev 0)	# Viol. (sev 1)	# Viol. (sev 2)	# Viol. (sev 3)	# Viol. (total)
H1: Visibility of Status	0	1	4	6	11
H2: Match Sys & World	0	0	1	0	1
H3: User Control	0	0	2	4	6
H4: Consistency & Standards	0	9	3	6	18
H5: Error Prevention	0	0	3	1	4
H6: Recognition not Recall	0	3	4	4	11
H7: Efficiency of Use	0	2	3	6	11
H8: Minimalist Design	0	9	6	4	19
H9: Help Users with Errors	0	0	1	1	2
H10: Help & Documentation	0	0	2	0	2
H11: Accessible	0	0	3	2	5
H12: Value Alignment & Inclusion	0	0	1	2	3
Total Violations by Severity	0	24	33	36	93

Note: check your answer for the green box by making sure the sum of the last column is equal to the sum of the last row (not including the green box)

4. Evaluation Statistics (in %)

Severity/Evaluator	Total # of Sev. Found	Evaluator A %	Evaluator B %	Evaluator C %	Evaluator D %
% Sev. 0	0	0	0	0	
% Sev. 1	24	8.33	4.17	41.67	45.83
% Sev. 2	33	42.42	9.09	33.33	15.15
% Sev. 3	36	33.33	8.33	47.22	11.11
% Sev. 4	1	0	1	0	0
Total (sev 3 & 4)	37	32.43	10.81	45.95	10.81
Total (all severity levels)	94	29.79	8.51	40.43	21.28

5. Summary Recommendations

GENERAL IMPRESSIONS

In general, it was easy to figure out the flow of the app, but we need clear labels or something to understand what's going on with more advanced options. The colors sometimes distract due to the visual hierarchy of light purple and dark purple not having enough contrast. We believe this design could benefit from a consistent system of text sizes, button sizes, and inputs.

We thought this app had a really nice design with pleasant colors. From the opening screen where you can see your own profile photo as a large image to the consistent color choice throughout the app, the app looks very uniform and aesthetically pleasing.

A few topics that you may want to ideate further on are:

- The most effective and efficient way to show users their feedback.
- The explore page content.
- Feedback preference selection.

TRENDS IDENTIFIED

Across the app, we definitely need messages to tell us what's up and how to fix it. It's a bit frustrating not knowing if our tracks are good to go or where to get feedback. There were also inconsistencies in functionality, such as reporting a user or giving and receiving feedback (for example, the lyrics option) that could be clarified. While the design aims for a minimalist aesthetic, the inconsistencies across buttons, text, and colors impede the interface's ease of interaction.

In terms of the heuristic violations, Keynotes displayed several trends in violations in the categories of visibility of system status, consistency and standards, and flexibility and efficiency of use. Across all

pages, there was a lack of notification on whether or not inputs were processed, such as feedback and changes in preferences.

One thing we noticed was a trend was that there were a couple buttons missing from certain pages such as a “back” button or a “report” button. There was also a lack of confirmation on whether a track has been successfully uploaded, leading to a potential lack of user confidence in the system. Moreover, since this is the first digital interaction of the product, there appears to be a lack of guidance for the user in how they can achieve their tasks, such as what the preferences do and how they can make use of each feature.

Hence, a notable tension throughout was whether simplicity should be balanced and weighed with over-elaboration. Another example of this tension would be in the uploading page, where it looks relatively clean and simple due to the “Advanced Options” button holding most of the content, yet Keynotes now risks users uploading their information too fast. This bleeds into the consistency of the app in terms of the design, with another notable trend being similarity in buttons that should have different priorities, such as the “report user” button being the same size, relative location, and prominence as the “view profile” button. Although designs should be consistent, this means that there is potential for error when the designs are too consistent as the users’ mindmap of the app may not be intuitive. Another example of this design issue would be how the users’ own profile has two buttons, “Preferences” and “Edit profile”, that are in the same location as the “Message” and “Add Friend” buttons in another persons’ profile.

Overall Recommendations

Beyond the specific heuristics, a critical concern that emerged is the absence of feedback for unsuccessful uploads or reviews. There should be cases in your forms for when a user fails or doesn’t put all the information in; it’s unclear what is mandatory and what is not. Overall, I like the direction of your app and think that the concept of sharing feedback is interesting! The more advanced options and profile exploration could use some fine-tuning, but the basic structure of the app made sense.

Some suggestions we made were to add a clearer UI showing the current tab with color, adding a playback feature that allows you to listen as you write the feedback, and possibly having larger font size. We would suggest using icons for things like settings or report users in addition to just the text. Also, I would add a header that shows the current tab especially for “Explore” and “Friends”.

There could be improvement on how Keynotes can be more efficient and intentional for the user, referring to the feedback page that the user is currently unable to categorize, quickly scroll through, or archive information once the inbox starts filling up. In streamlining the feedback receiving process, this can make Keynotes more efficient especially for more experienced users.

Consider implementing some page that is dedicated to the user’s feedback and decoupling that from the profile page. To be clear, the profile page should still feature tracks, but ideally

there would be a way for users to access their feedback without having to navigate to their own profile first. It would be awesome if your app had a view that synthesized all of the feedback for each track, with the option to drill down into detailed user feedback if desired.

Additionally, if your intention is that anyone who meets your feedback preference criteria can give you feedback, consider spending additional time thinking through how you might mitigate the negative implications of this. It could be useful to give users the option to only allow feedback from people on their friends list.

Lastly, it might be interesting to have two types of explore views in your app – a view that is optimized for exploring tracks to give feedback on, and a view that is optimized for exploring musicians to add as a friend. It seems like perhaps your current explore view is meant to serve both purposes simultaneously, but there could be an opportunity to have separate views that are more tailored to the goal of each view.

Severity Ratings

- 0 - not a usability problem
- 1 - cosmetic problem
- 2 - minor usability problem
- 3 - major usability problem; important to fix
- 4 - usability catastrophe; imperative to fix

Heuristics

H1: Visibility of System Status

- Keep users informed about what is going on

H2: Match Between System & Real World

- Speak the users' language
- Follow real world conventions

H3: User Control & Freedom

- “Exits” for mistaken choices, undo, redo
- Don't force down fixed paths

H4: Consistency & Standards

- Words, actions, and UI elements should be consistent across the entire platform
- Follow platform and industry conventions

H5: Error Prevention

- Minimize error-prone conditions
- Remove memory burdens, support undoing, and warn your users when necessary

H6: Recognition Rather Than Recall

- Make objects, actions, options, & directions visible or easily retrievable

H7: Flexibility & Efficiency of Use

- Accelerators for experts (e.g., gestures, keyboard shortcuts)
- Allow users to tailor frequent actions (e.g., macros)

H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design

- No irrelevant information. Focus on the essentials.

H9: Help Users Recognize, Diagnose, & Recover from Errors

- Error messages in plain language
- Precisely indicate the problem
- Constructively suggest a solution

H10: Help & Documentation

- Easy to search
- Focused on the user's task
- List concrete steps to carry out
- Not too large

H11: Accessible

- Users can interact with the system using alternative input methods.
- Content is legible with distinguishable contrast and text size.
- Key information is upfront and not nested for screen readers.
- Purely visual or auditory content has text-based alternatives for users with low vision and low hearing.

H12: Value Alignment and Inclusion

- The design should encode values that users can understand and relate to.
- It should make a diverse group of users feel included and respected.
- The design should prevent the reproduction of pre-existing inequities and not create additional burdens for members of disadvantaged populations.